Nickel Content Limits for API 5CT Sour Service Products

API TECHNICAL REPORT 5NCL
FIRST EDITION, APRIL 2025



Special Notes

API publications necessarily address problems of a general nature. With respect to particular circumstances, local, state, and federal laws and regulations should be reviewed. The use of API publications is voluntary. In some cases, third parties or authorities having jurisdiction may choose to incorporate API standards by reference and may mandate compliance.

Neither API nor any of API's employees, subcontractors, consultants, committees, or other assignees make any warranty or representation, either express or implied, with respect to the accuracy, completeness, or usefulness of the information contained herein, or assume any liability or responsibility for any use, or the results of such use, of any information or process disclosed in this publication. Neither API nor any of API's employees, subcontractors, consultants, or other assignees represent that use of this publication would not infringe upon privately owned rights.

API publications may be used by anyone desiring to do so. Every effort has been made by the Institute to ensure the accuracy and reliability of the data contained in them; however, the Institute makes no representation, warranty, or guarantee in connection with this publication and hereby expressly disclaims any liability or responsibility for loss or damage resulting from its use or for the violation of any authorities having jurisdiction with which this publication may conflict.

API publications are published to facilitate the broad availability of proven, sound engineering and operating practices. These publications are not intended to obviate the need for applying sound engineering judgment regarding when and where these publications should be used. The formulation and publication of API publications is not intended in any way to inhibit anyone from using any other practices.

Any manufacturer marking equipment or materials in conformance with the marking requirements of an API standard is solely responsible for complying with all the applicable requirements of that standard. API does not represent, warrant, or guarantee that such products do in fact conform to the applicable API standard.

All rights reserved. No part of this work may be reproduced, translated, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without prior written permission from the publisher. Contact the Publisher, API Publishing Services, 200 Massachusetts Avenue, NW, Suite 1100, Washington, DC 20001-5571.

Copyright © 2025 American Petroleum Institute

Foreword

Nothing contained in any API publication is to be construed as granting any right, by implication or otherwise, for the manufacture, sale, or use of any method, apparatus, or product covered by letters patent. Neither should anything contained in the publication be construed as insuring anyone against liability for infringement of letters patent.

Suggested revisions are invited and should be submitted to the Standards Department, API, 200 Massachusetts Avenue NW, Suite 1100, Washington, DC 20001, standards@api.org.

Contents

Page

1 Scope 1

2 Normative References 1

3 Terms and Definitions 1

4 Literature Review 1
4.1 General 1
4.2 OTC 3509-MS 1
4.3 Metallurgical Transactions A, Vol. 17, No. 9, p. 1601–1610 1
4.4 Corrosion, Vol. 42, No. 4, p. 222–233 2
4.5 Corrosion, Vol. 46, No. 2, p. 142–146 2
4.6 TWI Group Sponsored Project 2
4.7 NACE Paper #12900 2

5 Testing Plan 3
5.1 Materials 3
5.2 Heat Treatments 3

6 Test Results 4
6.1 Mechanical Properties 4
6.2 Microstructure 5
6.3 Corrosion Testing 8

7 Discussion of Test Results 10

8 Conclusions 11

9 Recommendations 11

Bibliography 12

Figures

1 AISI 4140 and 4340 DCB Samples Used for Microstructure Evaluation 5
2 Optical Microscope Image of Microstructure Showing Tempered Martensite for Both AISI 4140 and 4340 Grades 6
3 SEM Image of Microstructure Showing Tempered Martentise with a Fine Distribution of Carbides for Both AISI 4140 and 4340 Grades 6
4 AISI 4140 Material Showing Regions of Large Grain Growth That Is Absent in AISI 4340 Material 7
5 MnS Inclusion in AISI 4140 Material Analyzed 7
6 Larger Size and Higher Density of MnS Inclusions in AISI 4340 Material Analyzed 7
7 Compliance Curve for DCB Testing 9
8 Post Test Image of DCB Specimens 10

Contents

Page

Tables

1 Product Form, Size of Heats Selected for Testing 3
2 Chemical Composition of Heats Selected for Testing 3
3 Hardenability of Heats, Selected per ASTM A255 3
4 Heat Treatment Details 4
5 Average Four Quadrant as Quenched Hardness Test Results 4
6 Tensile Test Results 4
7 Charpy V-notch Impact Test Results 5
8 NACE TM0177 Method A Test Results at Boundary Limits of MR0175/ISO 15156-2 Region 0 8
9 NACE TM0177 Method A Test Results at 80 °C (175 °F) 8
10 NACE TM0177 Method D Test Results with 0.007 bar (0.1 psi) H_2S at pH 4.5 9

Introduction

Many studies have been performed regarding the effect of nickel content on sulfide stress cracking (SSC) of low-alloy steels. The results of these studies, however, have not been conclusive. As a result, API 5CT:2018 [1] restricts the maximum nickel (Ni) content in some grades—such as Q125—but not for others—such as P110. NACE MR0175-2021/ISO 15156-2:2020, which provides guidelines for SSC resistance and selection criteria for use of carbon and low-alloy steels (LAS) in sour service, does restrict the maximum Ni-content to <1 for low-hardness steels (in Section A.2.1.2) [2]. These two documents have dissuaded the oil and gas industry from using higher nickel (1 % or greater) steels in sour service. A review of these studies, however, suggests that Ni-content may not restrict SSC resistance of steels, and the underlying microstructure obtained from processing, such as heat treatment and mechanical processing, plays a more important role instead.

With this background, limited testing was performed to compare AISI 4140 (low Ni-content) and AISI 4340 (high Ni-content) steels for their SSC resistance when heat treated to a similar yield strength. The yield strength selected was close to the upper limit of API 5CT [3] grade P110, which also overlaps with the yield strength range of API 5CT:2018 grade Q125. This study showed that AISI 4340 could have higher SSC resistance relative to 4140 at similar strength levels, again suggesting that Ni-content may not restrict SSC resistance. With API assistance, a more detailed study on steels of different Ni-contents is recommended to understand how nickel affects microstructure and cracking resistance. Chemical compositions for API 5CT grades and NACE MR0175 could then be suitably modified.

Low-alloy steels have been traditionally restricted by NACE MR0175/ISO 15156 to Ni-contents below 1 % on the assumption that higher nickel concentrations could negatively affect SSC resistance. For components manufactured to API 5CT grade P110, the use of commercial Ni-containing grades with better hardenability, such as UNS G43XX alloys, could enable heavier wall thicknesses with better toughness to meet API 5CT requirements.

NACE MR0175-2021/ISO 15156-2:2020 Section A.2.1.2 states that “Carbon and low-alloy steels are acceptable at 22 HRC maximum hardness provided they contain less than 1 % mass fraction nickel”. Similarly, API 5CT:2018 Table E.4 does not restrict nickel content for grades below 80 ksi SMYS (specified minimum yield strength). However, nickel content is restricted for L80, C90, T95, and Q125 to 0.99 % maximum, whereas the P110 grade has no restrictions on nickel content.

The limitation in NACE MR0175/ISO 15156 was mostly based on a body of research conducted during the 1960s and 1970s. In their pioneering work, R. S. Treseder and T. M. Swanson [4] and A. K. Dunlop [5], found that LAS with more than 1.0 wt% nickel were more susceptible to SSC under similar loading and environmental conditions. Treseder and Swanson also reported that steels with a Ni-content higher than 1.0 wt% were susceptible to SSC even if hardness was kept under 235-BHN, which is equivalent to the 22-HRC limit now adopted by NACE MR0175/ISO 15156.

This limitation has created some challenges for HPHT applications that require strengths above 552 MPa (80 ksi) SMYS and hardness above 22 HRC. Commercial nickel-containing grades—such as UNS G43XX—may be needed to meet the hardenability and toughness requirements for heavy section components that some non-nickel-containing low-alloy steels would not meet. While early research suggested 43XX grades at lower hardness of 22 HRC max (552 MPa/80 ksi SMYS) may have lower SSC resistance than low nickel-containing steels with similar hardness limits, the performance of 43XX-type grades at higher strengths of 758 MPa/110 ksi SMYS or 862 MPa/125 ksi SMYS compared with that of P110 or Q125 equivalents with lower Ni-content had not been considered. This study is a step in that direction.

There is a commercial benefit for HPHT reservoirs to qualify nickel-containing LAS for use in API 5CT and NACE MR0175/ISO 15156 service, especially at higher temperatures. Heavy-wall accessories in particular are designed to withstand higher loads and tend to require P110 or Q125 grades. Due to the hardenability limitations of grades typically used (i.e., AISI 4130/4140), higher Ni-content grades (i.e., AISI 4330/4340) would be useful for such components. Although API 5CT:2018 grades P110 or Q125 are not “sour grades,” their use in elevated temperatures in sour service is allowed by NACE MR0175/ISO 15156, enabling a reliability and availability for those applications.

Nickel Content Limits for API 5CT Sour Service Products

1 Scope

This technical report is a review of the literature and subsequent corrosion testing performed to explore if the limits on nickel (Ni)-content in low-alloy steels (LAS) can be revised.

There exists a legacy limitation on the Ni-content in LAS for deployment in sour service due to a perception on significantly reduced resistance to sulfide stress cracking (SSC) when nickel contents above 1 wt% are present. NACE MR0175-2021/ISO 15156-2:2020 contains an explicit limit of maximum 1 wt% Ni for low-hardness steels, and API 5CT:2018 enforced this limit on sour grades and grade Q125. This 1 wt% maximum Ni limitation for LAS may hinder development of HPHT reservoirs by prohibiting grades that may be suitable for heavy-wall, high-strength applications.

The outcome of the study suggests that Ni-content may not restrict SSC resistance of LAS, and the underlying microstructure obtained from processing, such as heat treatment and mechanical processing, plays a more important role instead.

2 Normative References

There are no normative references for this document.

3 Terms and Definitions

There are no terms and definitions for this document.

4 Literature Review

4.1 General

Regardless of the actual cracking mechanisms, research indicates that the SSC resistance of both Ni-free and Ni-bearing low-alloy steels is contingent on the interdependency of heat treatment, microstructure, and strength/hardness. In this regard, fully tempered martensite showed the best sour service performance, followed by lower bainite [6]. In contrast, presence of untempered martensite and upper bainite reduces SSC resistance significantly. Below are summaries of some of these studies.

4.2 OTC 3509-MS [7]

The effect of nickel on SSC resistance is presented in OTC 3509-MS for AISI 4130-type steels and for a medium carbon alloy steel (0.22 % C, 2.00 % Cr, 0.60 % Mo, 0.20 % V), respectively. As OTC 3509-MS shows, Ni-contents up to ~1.0 wt% have no effect on SSC resistance, but above ~1.0 wt% did cause SSC resistance to decrease. The tests used a survival stress level statistically determined (designated as σ_{50}), representing a median failure stress level as a way to assess cracking resistance.

4.3 Metallurgical Transactions A, Vol. 17, No. 9, p. 1601–1610 [8]

The objective of this study was to compare the performance of selected nickel containing low-alloy steels in a standard H_2S environment with that of nominally nickel-free AISI 4130 steel at comparable strength and hardness levels (yield strength (YS) ≈ 690 MPa (100 ksi), HRC ≤ 22).

Five commercial low-alloy steels with nominal Ni-contents ranging from 0 %–3 % were selected. These were quenched and tempered to the desired hardness. In addition, five different tempering treatments were used for one of the steels (AISI 4330) to establish the effect of minor microstructural changes on the SSC cracking susceptibility.