International Standard

ISO/IEC 19788-1

Second edition
2024-11

Information technology for learning, education and training — Metadata for learning resources —

Part 1: Framework

Technologies de l'information pour l'apprentissage, l'éducation et la formation — Métadonnées pour ressources d'apprentissage —

Partie 1: Cadre de référence

Reference number
ISO/IEC 19788-1:2024(en)

© ISO/IEC 2024



COPYRIGHT PROTECTED DOCUMENT

© ISO/IEC 2024

All rights reserved. Unless otherwise specified, or required in the context of its implementation, no part of this publication may be reproduced or utilized otherwise in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, or posting on the internet or an intranet, without prior written permission. Permission can be requested from either ISO at the address below or ISO's member body in the country of the requester.

ISO copyright office
CP 401 • Ch. de Blandonnet 8
CH-1214 Vernier, Geneva
Phone: +41 22 749 01 11
Email: copyright@iso.org
Website: www.iso.org

Published in Switzerland

Contents

Page

Foreword ..... **vi**
Introduction ..... **vii**
1 Scope **1**
2 Normative references **1**
3 Terms and definitions **2**
4 Abbreviated terms **9**
5 Digital access **9**
6 MLR Resource classes **10**
6.1 General 10
6.2 Resource class specification attributes 10
6.2.1 Attribute "Identifier" 10
6.2.2 Attribute "Canonical identifier" 11
6.2.3 Attribute "Label" 11
6.2.4 Attribute "Name" 12
6.2.5 Attribute "Definition" 12
6.2.6 Attribute "Subclass of" 12
6.2.7 Attribute "Note" 13
6.3 Resource class specification template 13
6.4 Example of a resource class specification 13
7 MLR Properties **14**
7.1 General 14
7.2 Property specification attributes 14
7.2.1 Attribute "Identifier" 14
7.2.2 Attribute "Canonical identifier" 15
7.2.3 Attribute "Label" 15
7.2.4 Attribute "Name" 16
7.2.5 Attribute "Definition" 16
7.2.6 Attribute "Domain" 17
7.2.7 Attribute "Codomain" 17
7.2.8 Attribute "Linguistic indicator" 17
7.2.9 Attribute "Content value rules" 18
7.2.10 Attribute "Refines" 19
7.2.11 Attribute "Example(s)" 19
7.2.12 Attribute "Note(s)" 19
7.2.13 Attribute "Best practice(s)" 20
7.2.14 Attribute "Status" 20
7.3 Essential vs non-essential attributes 20
7.4 Property specification template 21
7.5 Aggregation of properties 21
7.6 Example of a property specification 22
7.6.1 General 22
7.6.2 Property specification 22
7.6.3 Associated content value rule set 23
8 MLR Vocabularies **23**
8.1 General 23
8.2 Vocabulary specification attributes 23
8.2.1 Attribute "Identifier" 23
8.2.2 Attribute "Canonical identifier" 24
8.2.3 Attribute "Label" 24
8.2.4 Attribute "Name" 25
8.2.5 Attribute "Open/closed" 25
8.2.6 Attribute "Extension of" 25

© ISO/IEC 2024 – All rights reserved

8.2.7 Attribute "Set of terms" 26
8.3 Vocabulary specification template 26
8.4 User extensions of MLR vocabularies 27
8.5 Example of vocabulary specifications 27
8.5.1 General 27
8.5.2 Vocabulary "Opportunity types" 27
8.5.3 Vocabulary "Extended opportunity types" 28

9 MLR Data elements 28
9.1 General 28
9.2 Data element specification attributes 29
9.2.1 Attribute " Property identifier " 29
9.2.2 Attribute "Subject" 29
9.2.3 Attribute "Content value" 29
9.2.4 Attribute "Language code" 30
9.3 Data element specification template 30
9.4 Examples of MLR data elements 30
9.4.1 EXAMPLE 1 30
9.4.2 EXAMPLE 2 (content value of the data element from a vocabulary) 30

10 MLR Records 30
10.1 General 30
10.2 MLR record: Components 31
10.2.1 Component "Identifier" 31
10.2.2 Component "Resource" 31
10.2.3 Component "Content" 31

11 MLR Application profiles 31
11.1 General 31
11.2 Application profile specification attributes 32
11.2.1 Attribute "Identifier" 32
11.2.2 Attribute "Canonical identifier" 32
11.2.3 Attribute "Label" 33
11.2.4 Attribute "Name" 33
11.2.5 Attribute "Description" 34
11.2.6 Attribute "Extension of" 34
11.2.7 Attribute "List of identifiers of templates for property constraints" 34
11.3 Application profile specification template 34
11.4 Constraint on properties 35
11.5 Constraint on properties template 35
11.5.1 Shape of the constraint on properties template 35
11.5.2 Content of the constraint on properties template 35
11.6 Example 36
11.6.1 Example of the specification of an application profile 37
11.6.2 Example of the specification of property constraints 37
11.6.3 Example of a Conditions Table 37
11.7 Ordered list of items 38
11.8 Global content value rule sets 38
11.9 Extension of an application profile 38
11.10 Documents specifying application profiles 39

12 Documents based on this document 39
12.1 New parts of the ISO/IEC 19788 series 39
12.2 Documents beyond ISO/IEC 19788 based on this standard 39
12.2.1 Documents specifying application profiles 39
12.2.2 Documents specifying MLR entities 39

13 Generic resource classes and LET related classes 40
13.1 General 40
13.2 Generic resource classes 40
13.2.1 Class "Resource" 40

© ISO/IEC 2024 – All rights reserved

13.2.2 Class "Information Resource" 40
13.2.3 Class "Web Resource" 41
13.2.4 Class "Representation" 41
13.3 Other resource classes 42
13.3.1 Class "Person" 42
13.3.2 Class "Learning Resource" 42

14 Generic properties 42
14.1 General 42
14.2 Properties whose domain is class "Resource" 43
14.2.1 Property "has Description" 43
14.2.2 Property "name" 43
14.3 Properties whose domain is class "Information Resource" 44
14.3.1 Property "describes" 44
14.3.2 Property "has representation" 45
14.4 Property whose domain is class "Web Resource" 45
14.4.1 Property "location" 45
14.5 Properties whose domain is class "Representation" 46
14.5.1 Property "character encoding" 46
14.5.2 Property "media type" 47
14.5.3 Property "refers to" 47
14.5.4 Property "represents" 48

15 Generic content value rule sets 48
15.1 General 48
15.2 MLR String 49
15.3 BCP 47 49
15.4 Boolean 49
15.5 Date 49
15.6 Date & Time 50
15.7 Duration 50
15.8 HTTP IRI 50
15.9 IRI 50
15.10 MEDIA TYPE 51
15.11 Time interval 51
15.12 JSON string 52

Annex A (normative) **Language equivalents for names and labels 53**

Annex B (normative) **MLR identifiers 54**

Annex C (normative) **MLR canonical identifiers and additional constraints on MLR specifications 58**

Annex D (normative) **Rules for all parts of ISO/IEC 19788 65**

Annex E (normative) **UML class diagram of generic and other resource classes and related properties 69**

Annex F (informative) **UML class diagrams for this document 70**

Annex G (informative) **Contents of documents specifying application profiles 73**

Annex H (informative) **Contents for documents beyond ISO/IEC 19788 specifying MLR entities 75**

Annex I (informative) **Principles governing the development of ISO/IEC 19788 77**

Bibliography 79

© ISO/IEC 2024 – All rights reserved

Foreword

ISO (the International Organization for Standardization) and IEC (the International Electrotechnical Commission) form the specialized system for worldwide standardization. National bodies that are members of ISO or IEC participate in the development of International Standards through technical committees established by the respective organization to deal with particular fields of technical activity. ISO and IEC technical committees collaborate in fields of mutual interest. Other international organizations, governmental and non-governmental, in liaison with ISO and IEC, also take part in the work.

The procedures used to develop this document and those intended for its further maintenance are described in the ISO/IEC Directives, Part 1. In particular, the different approval criteria needed for the different types of document should be noted. This document was drafted in accordance with the editorial rules of the ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2 (see www.iso.org/directives or www.iec.ch/members_experts/refdocs).

ISO and IEC draw attention to the possibility that the implementation of this document may involve the use of (a) patent(s). ISO and IEC take no position concerning the evidence, validity or applicability of any claimed patent rights in respect thereof. As of the date of publication of this document, ISO and IEC had not received notice of (a) patent(s) which may be required to implement this document. However, implementers are cautioned that this may not represent the latest information, which may be obtained from the patent database available at www.iso.org/patents and https://patents.iec.ch. ISO and IEC shall not be held responsible for identifying any or all such patent rights.

Any trade name used in this document is information given for the convenience of users and does not constitute an endorsement.

For an explanation of the voluntary nature of standards, the meaning of ISO specific terms and expressions related to conformity assessment, as well as information about ISO's adherence to the World Trade Organization (WTO) principles in the Technical Barriers to Trade (TBT) see www.iso.org/iso/foreword.html. In the IEC, see www.iec.ch/understanding-standards.

This document was prepared by Joint Technical Committee ISO/IEC JTC 1, *Information technology*, Subcommittee SC 36, *Information technology for learning, education and training*.

This second edition cancels and replaces the first edition (ISO/IEC 19788-1:2011), which has been technically revised. It also incorporates amendment 1 (ISO/IEC 19788-1:2011/AMD 1:2014).

The main changes are as follows:

— Generic terms and definitions, previously in ISO/IEC 19788-8:2015 (Annex E) have been added to Clause 3;

— An attribute "label" has been added to MLR specification templates for resource classes, properties (DESs in ISO/IEC 19788-1:2011), application profiles, generic content rule sets, vocabularies, and vocabulary terms;

— "Data element specification" has been renamed to "property specification";

— Redefining what an application profile is and deleting data element groups (DEGs);

— Clause 8 about MLR Vocabularies has been added. This clause solves a long-standing problem with the MLR Standard: The non-existence of a normalized way to specify/describe MLR vocabulary in a technology independent way;

— the entire content of the document has been reviewed and modified where necessary.

A list of all parts in the ISO/IEC 19788 series can be found on the ISO and IEC websites.

Any feedback or questions on this document should be directed to the user's national standards body. A complete listing of these bodies can be found at www.iso.org/members.html and www.iec.ch/national-committees.

© ISO/IEC 2024 – All rights reserved

Introduction

0.1 Purpose and overview

This document was originally designed as a framework for the specification of metadata describing learning resources (hence it's title MLR: Metadata for Learning Resources). Its use in SC36 to specify metadata about competences or accessibility has shown that its scope is broader than originally intended.

This document is about providing a metadata framework relevant to several committees and sectors and is of crucial importance to ensure coherence across standardization deliverables. The framework provides specification of generic entities and rules governing their use. This would then be used to define the semantic (meaning) of any type of information in a predictable way. This framework is information-technology-neutral and defines a set of common approaches, i.e. methodologies and constructs. The key principles are informed by a user requirements-driven context with the aim of supporting multilingual and cultural adaptability requirements from a global perspective, providing a way to link semantics to content.

This document includes rules for the assignment and management of identifiers and the development of subsequent documents fulfilling specific user needs.

Additionally, this document specifies how to define application profiles.

Some generic resource classes and properties are included in this document but there are few of them. Excluded from this document are the specification of bindings for properties (e.g. XML or RDF/OWL bindings) and the description of particular application profiles. These will be considered in subsequent documents. Nevertheless, code may be used in an informal way in examples.

The primary purpose of the ISO/IEC 19788 series is to facilitate: (1) the description of a learning resource by providing a standards-based approach to the identification and specification of the properties required to describe a learning resource, for example, as a metadata learning resource (MLR) record; and, (2) the search, discovery, acquisition, evaluation, and use of learning resources, for instance by learners, instructors or automated software processes. The interoperability of these functions can be achieved through harvesting or federated search processes, among other technologies and solutions. ISO/IEC 19788 (all parts) is based on identified user requirements.

At the same time, ISO/IEC 19788 (all parts) takes into account the diversity of cultural and linguistic contexts in which learning resources and their metadata are likely to be created and exploited. ISO/IEC 19788 (all parts) also facilitates the sharing and reuse of learning resource descriptions.

ISO/IEC 19788 (all parts) aims to specify properties relating to learning resources to be expressed in a range of established formats, providing some compatibility with IEEE 1484.12.1-2002,[2] ISO 15836-1:2017[4] and ISO 15836-2:2019[5] (as exemplified by ISO/IEC 19788-2 and amendment), while also addressing user-driven requirements and uses not explicitly addressed in those two standards. These properties are used to form the description of a learning resource.

In addition to having this document, ISO/IEC 19788 (all parts) is modularly structured with all subsequent parts having a distinct scope. Some of these parts represent a specified set of user requirements for the identification and specification of properties having a particular focus and intended use in the description of a learning resource. This includes collections of properties focused on technical perspectives, educational (pedagogical) aspects, etc.

0.2 About the description of resources

Properties are the basis of the resource description. However, not all properties are relevant to describe all resources. Indeed, a person is not described like a book. So, when specifying a property, a type of resources containing all the entities the property may be applied to, a domain for the property is provided.

An important aspect of MLR is the notion of classes of resources, i.e., sets of resources sharing common characteristics (e.g. books, people). Classes can be linked together by an inheritance relationship. This notion is to be understood as close to the notion of subset. If class A inherits from class B then all instances of A are also instances of B and instances of all classes from which B inherits.

© ISO/IEC 2024 – All rights reserved

MLR supports multiple inheritance. In addition, a resource can belong to two classes that are not in a hierarchy. Moreover, it is not necessary before describing a resource to declare a class it is an instance of. If a property applies to a resource, then the resource in question is an instance of the class that is declared as the domain of the property.

The description of a resource is done by making explicit the characteristics of the resource in consideration. Each characteristic is made explicit by specifying the property involved, the resource described and the value of the property for that resource. This is the purpose of MLR data elements.

The values of properties can be either data like a specific date (a date of birth for example) or references to other resources (the author of a book being itself a resource with its own characteristics that can itself linked to other resources and so on).

0.3 About neutral identifiers

A base principle of the approach of this document is that it is linguistically and culturally neutral, even if its text is in English. This is achieved by using language and culture-neutral identifiers. Thus, a designation in the desired language can be associated with a given identifier (e.g. of a property, of a vocabulary term), meaning the same identifier can have as many different names as languages.

Identifiers for MLR entities (properties, resource classes, generic content value rule sets, application profiles, vocabularies and vocabulary terms) are unique reference and permanent tags.

Those identifiers are:

— language-neutral,

— unambiguous in the identification of a particular MLR entity in ISO/IEC 19788 (all parts), related standards or any other type of document based on this document,

— be used to reference and cross-reference MLR entities,

— be information technology independent,

— be as self-explanatory as possible.

The design of MLR identifiers is explained in Annex B.

Canonical identifiers for MLR entities provide a way to denote the common "essence" of entities that are essentially the same. Usually, the description associated with such an identifier is the latest version of the specification/description of the entity. Canonical identifiers are preferentially used if they exist. The design of MLR canonical identifiers is explained in Annex C.

Non-canonical identifiers are only used by persons writing normative documents based on this document. Using non-canonical identifiers allows to keep the history of modifications to the definitions.

In ISO/IEC 19788 (all parts), URI/IRI are used as identifiers for resources (they denote resources). A URI/IRI denoting a resource based on HTTP uses the ‘http’ scheme, not the ‘https’ scheme. Any URI/IRI identifier using the ‘https’ scheme will be deemed to be the identifier obtained by replacing ‘https’ by ‘http’.

© ISO/IEC 2024 – All rights reserved

Information technology for learning, education and training — Metadata for learning resources —

Part 1: Framework

1 Scope

This document provides a framework that applies to all resources and specifies how to describe resources. It includes rules governing the way in which descriptions are made.

This document provides principles, rules and structures for specifying the description of any type of resource; it identifies and establishes attributes for specifying properties, resources classes, vocabularies and application profiles and the rules governing their use. The key principles set out in this document are framed in a user-centric context and aim to meet the requirements of multilingual and cultural adaptability from a global perspective.

This document can be used for the specification of metadata describing any type of resource (not only learning resources). This document is information-technology-neutral and defines a set of common approaches.

This document specifies generic properties, generic resource classes and predefined rule sets for content value rules. These generic elements are proposed in such a way that they can be widely reused, thereby promoting interoperability.

This document is applicable to the development of:

— application profiles based on the ISO/IEC 19788 series but not part of it or any other document based on it,

— standards consisting of the description of resources (in a broad sense), whether they belong to the domain of education or to any other domain.

2 Normative references

The following documents are referred to in the text in such a way that some or all of their content constitutes requirements of this document. For dated references, only the edition cited applies. For undated references, the latest edition of the referenced document (including any amendments) applies.

ISO 639-3[1)], *Codes for the representation of names of languages — Part 3: Alpha-3 code for comprehensive coverage of languages*

ISO 8601-1:2019, *Date and time — Representations for information interchange — Part 1: Basic rules*

ISO/IEC 10646, *Information technology — Universal coded character set (UCS)*

IETF RFC 3987[2)], *Internationalized Resource Identifiers (IRIs)*

IETF RFC 5646[3)], *Tags for Identifying Languages*

1) Cancelled and replaced by ISO 639. ISO 639-3 is available at: https://iso639-3.sil.org/code_tables/639/data

2) Available at: https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc3987

3) Available at: https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc5646

© ISO/IEC 2024 – All rights reserved

IETF RFC 6838[4], *Media Type Specifications and Registration Procedures*

IETF RFC 8259[5], *The JavaScript Object Notation (JSON) Data Interchange Format*

W3C Recommendation,[6] *Extensible Markup Language (XML) 1.1*

3 Terms and definitions

For the purposes of this document, the following terms and definitions apply.

ISO and IEC maintain terminology databases for use in standardization at the following addresses:

— ISO Online browsing platform: available at https://www.iso.org/obp

— IEC Electropedia: available at https://www.electropedia.org/

3.1
application profile
defined structured collection of *properties* (3.49) chosen to satisfy the particular needs of a community, or communities

Note 1 to entry: The properties are from the various parts of ISO/IEC 19788 and from other sources.

Note 2 to entry: This collection of properties is accompanied by constraints about their presence and repeatability.

3.2
attribute
field that represents information in a template

3.3
attribute value
information recorded as the content of an *attribute* (3.2) in an *MLR specification* (3.40)

Note 1 to entry: It is good practice to indicate by the string "N/A" that no value should be provided for this attribute.

Note 2 to entry: It is good practice to indicate by the string "-" that no values are provided but could have been.

3.4
characteristic
abstraction of a feature of an *object* (3.46)

Note 1 to entry: Characteristics are used for describing *concepts* (3.6)

3.5
codomain
<property> set containing the possible values for the *property* (3.49) under consideration, this set is either a *resource class* (3.54) or a set of *literals* (3.22)

Note 1 to entry: The information concerning the codomain of a *property* (3.49) is provided as the values of the *attribute* (3.2) "Codomain" of its specification.

3.6
concept
unit of knowledge created by a unique combination of *characteristics* (3.4)

Note 1 to entry: Concepts are not necessarily bound to particular natural languages. They are, however, influenced by the social or cultural background which often leads to different categorizations.

---

4) Available at: https://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc6838

5) Available at: https://www.rfc-editor.org/rfc/rfc8259

6) Available at: https://www.w3.org/TR/xml11/

© ISO/IEC 2024 – All rights reserved